

# International Journal of Public Sector Performance Management

 This journal also publishes Open Access articles



**Editor in Chief**

Prof. Leo Paul Dana

**ISSN online**

1741-105X

**ISSN print**

1741-1041

8 issues per year

Subscription price

**CiteScore**

0.8 (2021)

## Scopus®

*IJPSM* fosters discussion on performance management in the public sector, with an emphasis on the implementation of performance management technologies. It acknowledges the complexity of public sector performance management as an interface between the values placed upon public sector activities and their implementation. This gap between what is desirable and what is feasible stands at the crossing of many public sector issues such as cultural and ideological processes as well as regulation and economic processes operating over different space-time scales.

## EDITORIAL BOARD

### Honorary Editor

- **Fouchet**, Robert, Université Aix-Marseille, France

### Editor in Chief

- **Dana**, Leo Paul, Montpellier Business School, France  
(lp762359@dal.ca)

### Associate Editors

- **Brahmi**, Mohsen, IAE Southern Campus and FEM. S. University, Tunisia
- **Šević**, Željko, Universiti Utara Malaysia, Malaysia
- **Turc**, Emil, Université Aix-Marseille, France

### Editorial Board Members

- **Baumard**, Philippe, University of California, Berkeley, USA
- **Bedrani**, Slimane, National Institute of Agronomy and Center of Applied Economics for Development (CREAD), Algeria
- **Benoît**, Bernard, Université Libre de Bruxelles, Belgium
- **Bianchi**, Piervito, University of Foggia, Italy
- **Bouayad**, Brahim, Cadi Ayyad University, Morocco
- **Côme**, Thierr, Université de Reims Champagne Ardennes, France
- **Carassus**, David, University of Pau and the Adour, France
- **Cepiku**, Denita, University of Rome "Tor Vergata", Italy
- **Cherif**, Mondher, University of Sfax, Tunisia
- **Drumaux**, Anne, Brussels Free University, Belgium
- **Emery**, Yves, IDHEAP (Swiss Graduate School of Public Administration), Switzerland
- **Eymeri-Douzans**, Jean-Michel, Institute of Political Science, France
- **Gagnon**, Jacques, University of Sherbrooke, Canada
- **Giauque**, David, University of Lausanne, Switzerland
- **Guenoun**, Marcel, Université Paul-Cezanne Aix-Marseille III, France
- **Gunardi**, Ardi, Universitas Pasundan, Indonesia
- **Halgand**, Nathalie, University of Nantes, France
- **Haouas**, Ilham, University of Dubai, United Arab Emirates
- **Hintea**, Calin Emilian, Babes-Bolyai University, Romania
- **Joshi**, Manoj, Amity University, India
- **Joyce**, Paul, Nottingham Trent University, UK
- **Kapur**, Vijay, University of Delhi, India
- **Kuhlmann**, Sabine, German University of Administrative Sciences, Germany
- **Leitão**, João, University of Beira Interior & CEG-IST, University of Lisbon, Portugal
- **Mazouz**, Bachir, Québec University, Canada
- **Mazzoleni**, Alberto, University of Brescia, Italy
- **Meneguzzo**, Marco, University of Rome "Tor Vergata", Italy

- **Moinard**, Christian, Audencia Nantes School of Management, France
- **Ohkita**, Kenichi, Aichi University, Japan
- **Orange**, Gérald, Rouen Graduate School of Management, France
- **Padovani**, Emanuele, University of Bologna, Italy
- **Pasquier**, Martial, IDHEAP (Swiss Graduate School of Public Administration), Switzerland
- **Pillania**, Rajesh K., Management Development Institute Gurgaon, India
- **Proctor**, Tony, University of Chester, UK
- **Proeller**, Isabella, University of Potsdam, Germany
- **Rocher**, Sebastien, University of Poitiers, France
- **Rochet**, Claude, Institute for Public Management and Economic Development (IGPDE), France
- **Scorsone**, Eric, Michigan State University, USA
- **Sedjari**, Ali, Université Mohamed V University, Morocco
- **Talbot**, Colin, University of Manchester, UK
- **Tanaka**, Hiraki, Shizuoka University of Art and Culture, Japan
- **Van Dooren**, Wouter, University of Antwerp, Belgium
- **Villeneuve**, Jean-Patrick, IDHEAP (Swiss Graduate School of Public Administration), Switzerland
- **Wei**, Liu, East China University of Politics and Law, China

# DAFTAR ISI

## Vol. 7, No. 4.

*Special Issue on: Emerging Challenges of Public Sector Management in Transition and Emerging Economies*

 NO ACCESS

### **Determinants in the prevention of bad financial management: case study Republic of Kosovo**

Gresa Mjaku Abdylmenaf Bexheti

Vol. 7, No. 4, pp 438–449 • June 28, 2021

<https://doi.org/10.1504/IJPSPM.2021.116376>

Abstract & Keywords ▾

 Abstract

 PDF

 NO ACCESS

### **Labour market transition of youth in developing economies: the case of countries in South East and Eastern Europe**

Avni Arifi Besnik Fetaj Stefan Qirici Selajdin Abdull

Vol. 7, No. 4, pp 450–460 • June 28, 2021

<https://doi.org/10.1504/IJPSPM.2021.116383>

Abstract & Keywords ▾

 Abstract

 PDF

 NO ACCESS

### **Role and impact of public debt in financing budget deficit and economic growth - with special study in Kosovo**

Refik Kryeziu

Vol. 7, No. 4, pp 461–470 • June 28, 2021

<https://doi.org/10.1504/IJPSPM.2021.116377>

Abstract & Keywords ▾

 Abstract

 PDF

 NO ACCESS

### **Informal street vendors' behaviour at Car-Free Day in Indonesia**

Dini Turipanam Alamanda Abdullah Ramdhani Grisna Anggadwita Anggraeni Permatasari Nisa Sa'adah

Vol. 7, No. 4, pp 471–483 • June 28, 2021

<https://doi.org/10.1504/IJPSPM.2021.116378>

Abstract & Keywords ▾

 Abstract

 PDF

 NO ACCESS

### **Kosovo's nation branding through private and public sector cooperation**

Emira Limani Shqipe Gërguri-Rashiti Selma Kurtishi-Kastrati Dina Sabry Said

Vol. 7, No. 4, pp 484–498 • June 28, 2021

<https://doi.org/10.1504/IJPSPM.2021.116379>

Abstract & Keywords ▾

 Abstract

 PDF

NO ACCESS

### Financial stability of pension systems in transition countries

Shpresa Alija Besnik Fetaj Abdylmenaf Bexheti

Vol. 7, No. 4, pp 499-509 • June 28, 2021

<https://doi.org/10.1504/IJPSM.2021.116394>

Abstract & Keywords

Abstract PDF

NO ACCESS

### Total quality management for changes of staff capacity in higher education: a model to follow in the public sector

Veronika Kareva Xhevair Memedi

Vol. 7, No. 4, pp 510-522 • June 28, 2021

<https://doi.org/10.1504/IJPSM.2021.116380>

Abstract & Keywords

Abstract PDF

NO ACCESS

### Perspective of counselling in social services: the case of Republic of North Macedonia

Hyrije Abazi-Alili Shenaj Hadzimustafa Remzije Rakipi Teuta Veseil-Kurtishi Blierta Abazi Chaushi

Vol. 7, No. 4, pp 523-533 • June 28, 2021

<https://doi.org/10.1504/IJPSM.2021.116395>

Abstract & Keywords

Abstract PDF

NO ACCESS

### Impact of the fiscal policy on economic growth: an analytical approach from the Republic of Kosovo

Donat Rexha Abdylmenaf Bexheti Kosovare Ukshini

Vol. 7, No. 4, pp 534-547 • June 28, 2021

<https://doi.org/10.1504/IJPSM.2021.116385>

Abstract & Keywords

Abstract PDF

---

## **Informal street vendors' behaviour at Car-Free Day in Indonesia**

---

### **Dini Turipanam Alamanda\***

Faculty of Economics,  
Garut University,  
Jl Raya Samarang 52A Garut, 44151, Indonesia  
Email: alamanda@fisip.uniga.ac.id  
\*Corresponding author

### **Abdullah Ramdhani**

Faculty of Social and Politics Sciences,  
Garut University,  
Jl. Cimanuk 285 Garut, 44151, Indonesia  
Email: aramdhani@fisip.uniga.ac.id

### **Grisna Anggadwita**

School of Economic and Business,  
Telkom University,  
Jl. Telekomunikasi 1 Bandung, 40257, Indonesia  
Email: grisnamailbox@yahoo.co.id

### **Anggraeni Permatasari**

Faculty of Business Administration,  
President University,  
Jababeka Education Park, Bekasi, 17550, Indonesia  
Email: anggraeni@president.ac.id

### **Nisa Sa'adah**

Faculty of Social and Politics Sciences,  
Garut University,  
Jl. Cimanuk 285 Garut, 44151, Indonesia  
Email: nisa.saadah49@gmail.com

**Abstract:** The purpose of this research is to discover what factors encourage someone to sell during Car-Free Day in Indonesia. By using an explorative quantitative method, data collection was carried out through interviews with 40 s and questionnaires given to 450 s in nine major cities in Indonesia. The results of the interviews in the Stage 1, ten factors were found that encourage someone to sell on Car-Free Day. The results of Stage 1 then became questionnaire inputs, where the sampling method was purposive distribution. The results of the study show that the ten factors examined through the

factoring process can be reduced to four factors. These factors are leisure activity, marketing, legality and public participation. The dominant factor that drives someone to sell on Car-Free Day is the consumer factor, or the existence of prospective buyers. The implications of these findings are explored.

**Keywords:** Car-Free Day; CFD; street vendors; entrepreneurship; prospective buyers; policy study; exploratory factor analysis; public participation.

**Reference** to this paper should be made as follows: Alamanda, D.T., Ramdhani, A., Anggadwita, G., Permatasari, A. and Sa'adah, N. (2021) 'Informal street vendors' behaviour at Car-Free Day in Indonesia', *Int. J. Public Sector Performance Management*, Vol. 7, No. 4, pp.471–483.

**Biographical notes:** Dini Turipanam Alamanda is an Assistant Professor of the School of Economics, Garut University, Indonesia. She conducts several courses related to strategic management and decision-making theory. Her expertise in research is service science and game theory. She has published more than 100 articles in reputable both national and international journals as well as international proceedings. Besides being a lecturer, she is also a business consultant on national and international scales. During leisure time, she manages her portal education website, and actively involved in social community of the Professional Mom Institute (Institut Ibu Professional), this community concerns about family education which has weekly agenda in Garut Regency.

Abdullah Ramdhani has been working as a Lecturer at the Garut University, since 2008. His interest of study is marketing research, both for teaching and doing research. Beside being a lecturer, he is known as a photographer and being the Chief of the Garut Photography Community, since 2011. He is also an active journal writer which has several popular articles that publish both on national and international journals. He is a PhD candidate at the Pasundan University with organisational behaviour as his topic of dissertation.

Grisna Anggadwita is a full time Lecturer from the Business Management of Telecommunications and Informatics Department, School of Economics and Business, Telkom University, Indonesia. She teaches courses in entrepreneurship, small business management, e-commerce and business process. Her research interests include entrepreneurial intention, technology management, women entrepreneurship, business incubator and innovation management. She is an active researcher who has published more than 100 articles in leading international and national journals as well as international proceedings. She received the award from the Telkom Education Foundation as the Top 10 Lecturers in Scientific Publications, in 2018 and 2019, and Award for Excellence 2019 – High Commended Paper by Emerald Group Publishing (*Journal of Science and Technology Policy Management*).

Anggraeni Permatasari is a full time Lecturer from the President University, Indonesia. She has more than five years of teaching, research, and consultancy experience and six years of social worker and analyst at non-government organisation (local and international). She also a social entrepreneur and SMEs' consultant in the local NGO-Indonesia. Her research interests would be on the topics, namely small and medium enterprises, social entrepreneurship, business model, public sector performance and corporate social responsibility. Currently, she is a PhD candidate at the School of Business and Management, Bandung Institute of Technology, Indonesia.

Nisa Sa'adah is a Research Assistant at the Faculty of Social and Political Sciences at the University of Garut and joins the interest group of decision making and policy studies. She was active in student organisations such as the Student Association and Islamic Forum. Some of the research that she participated in related to policies at the Car Free Day event in Garut Regency, conflict resolution, student's talent mapping, and some researches related to public policy. Aside from being an active observer, she also manages a family-owned education foundation. As a young entrepreneur, she often participates in seminars that can develop her family business.

This paper is a revised and expanded version of a paper entitled 'Informal Street Vendors' Behavior at Car-Free Day in Indonesia' presented at 3rd International Scientific Conference on Business and Economics (ISCBE), Skopje, North Macedonia, 13–15 June 2019.

---

## 1 Introduction

Car-Free Day (CFD) is an event that encourages vehicle owners to not use a vehicle for a day (Prabowo et al., 2019). World Car-Free Day is celebrated every September 22 throughout the world. According to *The Washington Post* (2019) in Awareness Days discussing about these activities is intended to increase mass transportation, walking and running, and community development. CFD activity has become a new economic resource for both permanent traders and impromptu traders, with almost three times the income compared to ordinary days (Rachman and Barus, 2019). This activity is an opportunity for the community to carry out entrepreneurial activities by encouraging people to identify business opportunities that can be done in these activities. Entrepreneurship is one of the engines of economic development acceleration (Ramadani et al., 2013). CFD becomes a new opportunity in entrepreneurship where an entrepreneur can mobilise resources in the pursuit of opportunities in the creation of new businesses through activities on CFD (Kobeissi and Wang, 2009). Sunday CFD activities are a trading opportunity in both big and small cities. Nineteen major cities have CFD activities in Indonesia, with hundreds of locations. Although it deviates from the original purpose, CFD implementation today is justified by the government. The main goals of community members attending a CFD are for a culinary tour (Prabowo et al., 2019) and/or to have family time during the weekend. Akbar (2018) mentions the seven best-selling items sold on CFDs: drinks, snacks, sports accessories, used goods, women's knickknacks, children's toys and kitchen utensils.

The number of street vendors in CFDs is increasing every year; on average 1,700 traders participated in the main CFD locations in big cities in 2018, a 10% increase from the previous year's average. In interviews with a number of traders, economic factors were revealed as one reason for selling, along with free time, promotion, and sometimes even to enliven CFD activities. Given that the initial purpose of the CFD was to provide open spaces for residents, the crowding of CFD locations with street vendors has narrowed people's activities in open spaces even further. Although prospective economic activities abound for tens of thousands of street vendors, CFDs still need better management in order to implement the initial objectives. Because of the importance of



policies regarding the CFD management in Indonesia, data regarding the behaviour of street vendors in CFDs needs to be assessed.

The purpose of this study was to explore what factors encourage someone to sell on CFD in Indonesia. Nine major cities in Indonesia were chosen as research locations, taking into consideration the crowds, the plurality, and the large number of street vendors. This research is a continuation of research on factors that encourage someone to come to CFD (Prabowo et al., 2019).

## **2 Theoretical foundation**

### *2.1 Street vendor*

In Indonesia, street vendors are known as *Pedagang Kaki Lima* (PKL) or five feet vendor. Street vendors are a number of informal business sectors that are directly related to city government policies (Handoyo and Setiawan, 2018). The term street vendor was first known in the Dutch colonial era, which is based on a five-foot (1.5 m) sidewalk made by the Dutch Government. While other information says that the street vendors appear because traders use a three-wheeled cart that is added to the feet of traders so that it becomes five feet (Permadi, 2007). Meanwhile according to Rukmana (2019), PKL are informal sector companies that include trading companies sometimes as producers. Some settled in certain locations, others moved from one place to another (using a cart, wheelbarrow) selling food, drinks and other consumer goods at retail.

The regulations regarding street vendors are in the Minister of Cooperatives and Small and Medium Enterprises Regulation of the Republic of Indonesia number 10/per/m.kukm/xii/2017 regarding Guidelines for the Implementation of the Arrangement of Street Vendors through Assistance Duty Funds for Fiscal Year 2018. However, unfortunately researches on street vendors in Indonesia are full of problems. Handoyo and Setiawan (2018) observed that the majority of street vendors in Indonesia are illegal and often get bad treatment from the city government. On the one hand, street vendors provide urban jobs that everyone can hold easily. On the other hand, if street vendors are not managed properly, they can create urban environmental problems (Permana et al., 2016). Street vendors can also be categorised into informal entrepreneurship where the status and level of education are not a major concern as long as individuals can take advantage of business opportunities (Ramadani et al., 2019).

### *2.2 Street vendor behaviour*

Street vendors influence shopping behaviour and urban consumers' perceptions of values, in that sales patterns with ethnic values can increase customer satisfaction (Rajagopal, 2009). The perceived benefit factors – comfort and value – are responsible for positively influencing consumer attitudes towards street vendors (Gupta, 2018). Street vendors are known for selling goods of relatively good quality at affordable prices (Guthena, 2017). In the culinary business, street vendors are very well-liked by the community, although they still need to pay attention and be reminded of cleanliness and safety (Sanlier et al., 2018).

On the other hand, street vendor behaviour often violates the rules of urban planning (Alamanda, 2011). Handoyo and Setiawan (2018) explained why street vendors use public space to sell wares; they found that these reasons include:

- 1 economic limitations that prevent renting special locations to sell
- 2 roads and sidewalks being a strategic place to sell merchandise
- 3 lack of attention from the government for the needs and welfare of street vendors.

The concepts of negotiation, power, social networking, and perception are used to analyse various strategies used by street vendors to gain access to urban public space via formal and informal forces (Forkuor et al., 2017).

### *2.3 Street vendor and CFD*

Local and central government policies regarding street vendors are most visible in the informal economy (Roever and Skinner, 2016; Handoyo and Setiawan, 2018). In Indonesia, CFD has shifted certain activities from public space to private space, because the public space is widely used by street vendors to sell and to setup stalls (Priyono et al., 2017). The impact of the economic sociology of CFD for street vendors was analysed by Devi et al. (2016) by looking at the production, distribution, public consumption and the cost of goods. Prabowo et al. (2019) explained that the presence of street vendors was the main factor motivating people to come to CFDs. Another positive side of implementing CFD (in terms of economic activities) is the increase in income of micro-economic players, such as small s (street vendors) who sell around the CFD location (Devi et al., 2016).

## **3 Methodology**

This research is a type of quantitative research that is explorative in nature. In this process, the research is divided into two stages: the exploration stage and the factor reduction stage. In the exploration stage, interaction observation and in-depth interviews (Dana and Dana, 2005) were conducted with 40 street vendors in nine major cities in Indonesia. The interview process is necessary for obtaining contextual information from the resource persons. The selection of these individuals was based on how long they had been trading in the CFD, the type of product they sold, and the status of selling (whether as the main source of income or as a side business).

The results of the interview revealed ten factors that encourage someone to sell on CFD. These factors include: number of consumers, legality, hobbies, economy, free time, effective marketing, efficient marketing, side business, participation and location. The factors found in Step 1 were compiled into a questionnaire that was then given to 450 CFD traders in the same nine cities. The cities were chosen based on the crowds of CFD activities and the plurality of the population, and included Jakarta, Bandung, Surabaya, Medan, Palembang, Balikpapan, Makassar, Denpasar and Jogjakarta. The priority CFDs are the largest in these cities (80%), and the rest (20%) are distributed across medium-scale CFDs, with a total of 15 CFDs in nine major cities in Indonesia. The distribution of the questionnaire is presented in Table 1, which shows that Jakarta

dominates the number of selected CFDs and the number of respondents, reaching 27% of the total. Bandung, Surabaya, and Medan have the same number of respondents (60 people), and the five other cities (Jogjakarta, Balikpapan, Denpasar, Makassar and Palembang) have 30 respondents each. The proportion of respondents is based on the number of CFDs used to collect samples in each city.

**Table 1** Questionnaire distribution based on city

<i>No.</i>	<i>City</i>	<i>Number of CFD</i>	<i>Number of respondents</i>
1	Jakarta	4	120
2	Bandung	2	60
3	Surabaya	2	60
4	Medan	2	60
5	Jogjakarta	1	30
6	Balikpapan	1	30
7	Denpasar	1	30
8	Makassar	1	30
9	Palembang	1	30
	Total	15	450

Table 2 shows the profiles of respondents regarding trading experience and the types of products offered at CFDs. Overall, participating respondents have less than three years of trading experience at CFDs; only respondents in Jakarta are dominated by traders with more than three years of experience. Of the types of goods offered, culinary goods are the most common, followed by fashion products, household equipment and others.

**Table 2** Respondent profile

<i>No.</i>	<i>Number of respondents</i>	<i>Trading experience</i>		<i>Types of product offered</i>			
		<i>&lt; 3 years</i>	<i>≥ 3 years</i>	<i>Culinary</i>	<i>Fashion</i>	<i>Household equipment</i>	<i>Miscellaneous</i>
1	Jakarta	33	87	80	20	10	10
2	Bandung	30	30	30	15	10	5
3	Surabaya	30	30	30	10	10	10
4	Medan	40	20	25	15	10	10
5	Jogjakarta	15	15	15	5	5	5
6	Balikpapan	20	10	10	10	5	5
7	Denpasar	20	10	5	10	5	10
8	Makassar	20	10	10	10	5	5
9	Palembang	20	10	10	10	5	5

Once collected, the data was then tested using an exploratory factor analysis (EFA) statistical test, with the help of SPSS 22 software. EFA was chosen because it was able to build a structure model consisting of a set of many variables where researchers do not have initial information and departed from the findings from the interview results. The Kaiser-Meyer-Olkin test measure of sampling adequacy (MSA) yielded a result of 0.558,

and all indicators indicate that the MSA score is above 0.5, which means that the variable can be further predicted and tested.

## 4 Discussion

### 4.1 Total variance explained

Total variance explained is useful for determining what factors might be formed. In Table 3, the component column shows ten components that can represent variables. However, because the specified eigenvalues are 1 and the extraction method adopts the principal component analysis, the total value taken is more than 1 – namely, components 1, 2, 3 and 4.

**Table 3** Total variance explained

<i>Component</i>	<i>Initial eigenvalues</i>			<i>Extraction sums of squared loadings</i>		
	<i>Total</i>	<i>% variance</i>	<i>Cumulative %</i>	<i>Total</i>	<i>% variance</i>	<i>Cumulative %</i>
Number of consumers	2.398	23.984	23.984	2.398	23.984	23.984
Legality	1.779	17.789	41.772	1.779	17.789	41.772
Hobby	1.201	12.014	53.787	1.201	12.014	53.787
Economy	1.086	10.857	64.644	1.086	10.857	64.644
Free time	0.976	9.763	74.406			
Efficient marketing	0.764	7.636	82.043			
Effective marketing	0.732	7.316	89.359			
Side business	0.561	5.615	94.973			
Location	0.291	2.906	97.879			
Participation	0.212	2.121	100.000			

### 4.2 Loading factor

It is now known that the maximum number of factors that can be formed is 4 (Table 3); Table 4 shows indicators are included in each factor. Ascertain which indicators to enter is determined by looking at the largest correlation value. Table 4 is sorted from the largest value to the smallest value per factor. The results show that four indicators are included in factor 1, consisting of side business, free time, economy and location; thus, factor 1 is called the ‘free time activities’ factor. Factor 2 consists of two indicators related to effective and efficient marketing and is called the ‘marketing’ factor. Factor 3 consists of only one factor and is named according to that indicator, making it the ‘legality’ factor. The last factor consists of three indicators, participation, hobby, and number of consumers, and is called the ‘public participation’ factor.

**Table 4** Loading factor and factoring

<i>No.</i>	<i>Factors</i>	<i>Indicators</i>	<i>Loading factor</i>
1	Free time activities	Side business	.820
		Free time	.739
		Economy	-.717
		Location	-.628
2	Marketing	Efficient marketing	.904
		Effective marketing	.895
3	Legality	Legality	.793
4	Public participation	Participation	-.787
		Hobby	.582
		Number of consumers	.298

### 4.3 Discussion

#### 4.3.1 Factor of free time activities

Many street vendors sell at CFDs as a side business to fill their spare time. This is not surprising, as it is in line with the results of the interviews. Nina (2019), a snack seller at CFD Bandung, is an elementary school teacher; for her, trading activities at CFD is not routine, because it is a side business. In contrast, Sandi (2019), a seller of household goods, said that old age limits his activities, and CFD is his opportunity to be able to interact with many people while being productive. Sandi's (2019) activities are usually done by parents as a form of social integration (Moisescu, 2014). Although typically a side business and done in one's free time, being a street vendor in CFDs can provide more absolute income than the average formal worker (Martínez et al., 2017).

Still, several traders depend on selling at CFDs. Iqbal (2019), a bag seller, said that it was difficult to find sales jobs at the CFD once a week; every day, Iqbal (2019) worked as a freelance porter. The economy factor here leans more towards secondary income source, thus even though they have different reasons; they all sell as a free time activity. CFD activities are also used by women who do not work in the formal sector to learn to trade because it is becoming a trend in society. These results are in line with the findings of Anggadwita et al. (2017) where social culture can have an impact on entrepreneurial activities especially for women entrepreneurs.

#### 4.3.2 Factor of marketing

The second factor that arises from the reduction process is related to marketing. s use CFDs or public open spaces as a place for effective and efficient marketing. Measuring the effectiveness of marketing tools is the most visible gap in marketing effectiveness (Daukševičiūtė et al., 2011). Marni (2019), a culinary at CFD Jakarta, said that her food products sell well because he does marketing at CFDs; besides being cheap, her merchandise also gets a strong response from the public. CFD does have a large economic impact and has a positive influence on local businesses (McKibbin, 2014).

The most commonly use marketing strategy is personal selling where traders and buyers face each other meet when traders make an introduction, persuade and influence

prospective buyers until a transaction occurs. The criteria of personal selling that are most favoured by s in CFD in Indonesia is cultivation, where the seller and buyer relationship is very close both when the transaction takes place or outside the CFD environment. Relationship marketing is often used by traders to foster and maintain good relationships with customers. While the type of personal selling used is responsive selling, which are sales expected to be able to react to buyer demand. The existence of CFDs makes the seller does not need to come to the location of prospective customers because on the contrary, customers come by themselves to the market (CFD).

### *4.3.3 Factor of legality*

Policy interventions must respond to specific street vendor contexts (Martínez et al., 2017). s claim that they know of no clear written rules pertaining to selling at CFDs. Rafki claimed that for four years, he only paid an annual fee to a middleman without knowing where the money went. Officially, there is no rule that street vendors must pay rent for stalls, but in reality, illegal fees exist. Because of this, street vendors consider the kiosks they occupy as their rented stall and therefore their right, a factor that contributes significantly to street vendors selling at CFDs.

The legality of CFDs in Indonesia varies by province/city because those are regulated by local regulations. In Jakarta, CFD activities are carried out based on the Special Regional Regulation of the Capital City of Jakarta No. 2. Year 2005 concerning Air Pollution Control Section 3 Article 27. Supported by Governor Regulation No. 12 of 2016 concerning Implementation of Car Free Day; Governor's Decree Number 545 of 2016 concerning Determination of Location, Schedule and Procedure for the Implementation of Car Free Day in DKI Jakarta Province; and Governor Decree Number 509 of 2016 concerning Work Team of Car Free Day. The CFD team is in charge from preparation to post-implementation activities which include coordination, implementation, and determination of CFD cancellations, report preparation, reporting and evaluating CFD activities.

While in Bandung, the capital city of West Java Province, CFD activities are carried out based on Mayor Decree Number: 551/Decree 1017 – Dept. of Transportation/2015 concerning the implementation of CFD in Bandung. Different with the CFD work team in Jakarta, the work team in Bandung has the task of making a schedule and work plan; mapping the point of location for CFD; holding a coordinating meeting; mapping needs for facilities, infrastructure and personnel; socialising and coordinating the implementation of CFDs; and reporting the activity to the Mayor of Bandung.

In Surabaya, the CFD is regulated on Surabaya Mayor Regulation No. 74 of 2013. It is different from the contents of the mayor's regulations in Bandung and Jakarta. In Surabaya, the implementation of the CFD involves regional work units that consist of the Environmental Agency, the National Unity Board, Politics and Community Protection, the Transportation Agency, the Sanitation and Parks Agency, the Communication and Information Agency, the Public Relations Section, the Civil Service Police Unit, the district headman and the village headman. In fact, the CFD implementation team only has a function to ensure the success of activities.

Yogyakarta is a city as well as a province like Jakarta. However, unlike Jakarta, specific regulations regarding CFD in Yogyakarta Province are not found in provincial regulations. Of the four regencies and one municipality in Yogyakarta, only Bantul Regency whose regulation could be accessed regarding the implementation of CFD

through the Bantul Regent Regulation Number 37 of 2016 concerning CFD. In the regulation, it is stated that the activities that could be implemented on CFD are aimed at attracting visitors, performing and demonstrating skill, creativity, promotion and service and trade offerings. While the implementation of CFD is left to a group called the 'joint secretariat'.

In Denpasar, the implementation of the CFD is carried out in certain areas regulated by Denpasar Mayor Regulation Number 28 of 2013 concerning the establishment of the Niti Mandala Renon area as the venue for CFD. In Denpasar, the implementation of CFD is directly the responsibility of the Denpasar City Transportation Agency. The main activity of CFDs is sports, but there are no restrictions regarding trading activities. Meanwhile, in three other cities, namely Balikpapan, Makassar and Palembang, no specific rules were found governing CFD activities.

From the findings, it could be concluded that regarding the legality of CFD in Indonesia is still not evenly distributed between one region to another with different contents of regulations. Some regions mentioned that trading activities are legal activities that can be carried out in CFDs. Other regions stated that CFDs are intended for sports, cycling, wheel shoes and other sports that are not dangerous without mentioning the prohibition of trading activities. There are also regional regulations which do not specifically mention trading activities but are packaged in the terms 'sports and others', 'others' in the regulation are considered as the legality of trading activities in CFDs. The lack of clarity on this regulation is deemed beneficial by s in CFDs because, as such, they were free to sell in areas where the CFDs are bound without worrying about getting unpleasant treatment from the government as is often the case to street vendors.

#### *4.3.4 Factor of public participation*

Many s join CFDs for participation reasons. Yuni (2019) said that she likes joint activities that involve many people. Yuni (2019) admitted that her merchandise, antiques, were not really meant to be sold, only displayed. Similarly, Dermawan (2019) claimed that the CFD was an arena for channelling his hobbies to trade; he also did not have special products offered. Overall, CFDs seem to be popular among participants and get support from local businesses to participate (McKibbin, 2014).

## **5 Conclusions**

Based on the total variance, the ten variables measured in encouraging people to sell at a CFD have been reduced to only four factors: the free-time activity factor, consisting of side business, free time, economy, and location; the marketing factor, consisting of effective and efficient marketing; the legality factor; and the public participation factor, which consists of participation, hobbies, and number of consumers.

## **6 Implications and future research direction**

The best suggestion that could be proposed regarding the implementation of CFDs in Indonesia is arrangement of street vendors. Street vendors who sell food are the most popular; it needs to be accompanied by orderliness, cleanliness and comfort. Provision of

bins that are friendly to culinary lovers needs to be provided in every culinary spot in CFDs. The process of checking and distributing waste also needs to be done every hour in order to avoid the accumulation of garbage that disrupts the comfort and cleanliness of food sold.

Non-strict government regulations are indeed considered beneficial by s in CFD. However, the results of observations and evaluations show that the presence of CFD s still needs a lot of arrangements so that the location of the CFD could be functioned as its original purpose as a convenient public open space with a vehicle-free location. CFDs in various cities still have homework, especially waste after the activity takes place. This study suggests that local governments, especially municipalities, make specific rules regarding CFD activities that can accommodate the needs of the community and street vendors(s) in CFD. Therefore, it is necessary to establish a Car-Free Day Council consisting of representatives of traders, city government officials, and other credible representatives from various elements of society such as academics, communities and consumers (Prabowo et al., 2017).

Further research can be done by adopting the qualitative method proposed by Dana and Dumez (2015) to better understand the situation that occurs in CFD activities, for example by managing the risk of CFD activities and expanding exploration of hypotheses that arise. In addition, the profile of traders in CFDs can be explored further by adding information on venture capital, length of trading during CFDs, and locations selling at CFDs, so that their effects on traders' income can be analysed.

## 7 Limitation of the study

This research has limitations because it is not preceded by an analysis of various stakeholders involved in CFD activities so that the discussion only focuses on the opinions of the traders only and ignores the arguments of the local government, control officers and consumers.

## Acknowledgements

We thank the Faculty of Social and Politics Sciences, Garut University, for the funding for this research.

## References

- Akbar, R.J. (2018) *Jualan 7 Barang ini di Car Free Day, Untungnya Banyak*, 13 July [online] <https://www.viva.co.id/berita/bisnis/1053581-jualan-7-barang-ini-di-car-free-day-untungnya-banyak> (accessed 16 April 2019).
- Alamanda, D.T. (2011) 'Pemodelan Matematika Berbasis Grafik untuk Menganalisis Konflik Bisnis Perkotaan Studi Kasus: Manajemen Pedagang Kaki Lima Bandung', *Forum Manajemen Indonesia (FMI)*, Bandung [online] [https://www.academia.edu/12091108/Pemodelan\\_Matematika\\_Berbasis\\_Grafik\\_Untuk\\_Menganalisis\\_Konflik\\_Bisnis\\_Perkotaan.\\_Studi\\_Kasus\\_Manajemen\\_Pedagang\\_Kaki\\_Lima\\_Bandung](https://www.academia.edu/12091108/Pemodelan_Matematika_Berbasis_Grafik_Untuk_Menganalisis_Konflik_Bisnis_Perkotaan._Studi_Kasus_Manajemen_Pedagang_Kaki_Lima_Bandung)



- Anggadwita, G., Luturlean, B., Ramadani, V. and Ratten, V. (2017) 'Socio-cultural environments and emerging economy entrepreneurship', *Journal of Entrepreneurship in Emerging Economies*, Vol. 9, No. 1, pp.85–96, DOI [online] <https://doi.org/10.1108/JEEE-03-2016-0011>.
- Dana, L.-P. and Dumez, H. (2015) 'Qualitative research revisited: epistemology of a comprehensive approach', *International Journal of Entrepreneurship and Small Business*, Vol. 26, No. 2, pp.154–170, DOI: 10.1504/IJESB.2015.071822.
- Dana, P. and Dana, T.E. (2005) 'Expanding the scope of methodologies used in entrepreneurship research', *Int. J. Entrepreneurship and Small Business*, Vol. 2, No. 1, pp.79–88.
- Daukševičiūtė, I., Valainis, A. and Vilkaitė, N. (2011) 'Conceptualization of the effectiveness of marketing tools', *Intellectual Economics*, Vol. 5, No. 2, pp.200–211.
- Dermawan, A. (2019) *Street Vendor*, Alamanda, D.T. (Interviewer), 15 January.
- Devi, C.S., Rustiyarso and Zakso, A. (2016) 'Dampak Car Free Day bagi Pedagang Kaki Lima di Kota Pontianak', *Jurnal Pendidikan dan Pembelajaran*, Vol. 5, No. 11, pp.1–6.
- Forkuor, J.B., Akuoko, K.O. and Yeboah, E.H. (2017) 'Negotiation and management strategies of street vendors in developing countries: a narrative review', *SAGE Open*, January–March, pp.1–13, DOI [online] <https://doi.org/10.1177/2158244017691563>.
- Gupta, V. (2018) 'A study on the street food dimensions and its effects on consumer attitude and behavioural intentions', *Tourism Review*, Vol. 73, No. 3, pp.374–388.
- Guthena, R.P. (2017). 'A study on factors and decision behaviour of consumers with street vendors at traffic signals', *International Journal of Advance Research, Ideas and Innovations in Technology*, Vol. 3, No. 6, pp.632–636.
- Handoyo, E. and Setiawan, A.B. (2018) 'Street vendors (PKL) as the survival strategy of poor community', *Jurnal Ekonomi dan Kebijakan*, Vol. 11, No. 1, pp.173–188.
- Iqbal, M. (2019) *Street Vendor*, Alamanda, D.T. (Interviewer), 5 January.
- Kobeissi, N. and Wang, H. (2009) 'Venture capital and economic growth in the local markets', *International Journal of Public Sector Performance Management*, Vol. 1, No. 3, pp.312–324.
- Marni, R. (2019) *Street Vendor*, Ramdhani, A. (Interviewer), 1 January.
- Martínez, L., Short, J.R. and Estrada, D. (2017) 'The urban informal economy: street vendors in Cali, Colombia', *Cities*, Vol. 66, pp.34–43.
- Mckibbin, D. (2014) *Car Free Days : A Literature Review*, Research and Information Service Briefing Paper.
- Moisescu, P.C. (2014) 'The social integration of elders through free-time activities', *Procedia – Social and Behavioral Sciences*, Vol. 116, pp.4159–4163.
- Nina, A. (2019) *Street Vendor*, Alamanda, D.T. (Interviewer), 5 January.
- Permadi, G. (2007) *Pedagang kaki lima: riwayatmu dulu, nasibmu kini!* [online] <https://doi.org/10.1101/269084>.
- Permana, A.S., Aziz, N.A. and Siong, H.C. (2016) 'Leadership styles: incentive or disincentive approach in addressing street vendor problems in Jakarta and Bandung, Indonesia', *Journal of the Malaysian Institute of Planners*, No. 4, pp.45–60.
- Prabowo, F., Rahadi, R.A. and Alamanda, D.T. (2017) 'Decomposing the problems of traditional markets business ecosystem in Indonesia', *International Journal of Public Sector Performance Management*, Vol. 3, No. 4, pp.375–397, DOI: 10.1504/IJPSM.2017.087657.
- Prabowo, F., Ramdhani, A., Alamanda, D.T., Kania, I., Akbar, G.G. and Hanifah, D.S. (2019) 'Investigating the true meaning of Car Free Day for Indonesian people', *20th International Symposium on Social Sciences, Education and Humanities (ISSEH)*, Uswagati, Cirebon [online] <https://doi.org/10.2991/isseh-18.2019.3>.
- Priyono, B., Rohidi, T.R. and Soesilowati, E. (2017) 'Patterns of public spaces based on 'sport for all' and people's adaptation process', *The Journal of Educational Development*, Vol. 5, No. 1, pp.59–71.

- Rachman, H.O. and Barus, L.S. (2019) 'Impact of Car-Free Day on air pollution and its multifarious advantages in Sudirman-Thamrin Street, Jakarta', *International Journal of GEOMATE*, Vol. 17, No. 62, pp.167–172 [online] <https://doi.org/10.21660/2019.62.8286>.
- Rajagopal, R. (2009) *Street Markets Influencing Consumer Behavior in Urban Habitat*, EGADE Working Paper No. 2009-03-MKT, 30 June, DOI: 10.2139/ssrn.1434943.
- Ramadani, V., Bexheti, A., Dana, L-P. and Ratten, V. (2019) 'Informal ethnic entrepreneurship: an overview', in Ramadani, V., Dana, L-P., Ratten, V. and Bexheti, A. (Eds.): *Informal Ethnic Entrepreneurship*, 1st ed., pp.1–7, Springer International Publishing, New York, DOI: 10.1007/978-3-319-99064-4.
- Ramadani, V., Gërguri, S., Rexhepi, G. and Abduli, S. (2013) 'Innovation and economic development: the case of FYR of Macedonia', *Journal of Balkan and Near Eastern Studies*, Vol. 15, No. 3, pp.324–345.
- Roever, S. and Skinner, C. (2016) 'Street vendors and cities', *Environment and Urbanization*, DOI [online] <https://doi.org/10.1177/0956247816653898>.
- Rukmana, M.G. (2019) 'Peran Satuan Polisi Pamong Praja Dalam Penertiban Pedagang Kaki Lima Di Kota Semarang', *Jurnal Konstituen* [online] <https://doi.org/10.33701/jk.v1i2.53>.
- Sandi, P. (2019) *Street Vendor*, Ramdhani, A. (Interviewer), 5 January.
- Sanlier, N., Sezgin, A.C., Sahin, G. and Yassibas, E. (2018) 'A study about the young consumers' consumption behaviors of street foods', *Ciênc. saúde coletiva*, Vol. 23, No. 5, pp.1647–1656.
- The Washington Post (2019) *One of D.C.'s Busiest Streets will be Turned Into a Car-Free Experiment Saturday* [online] <https://www.washingtonpost.com/transportation/2019/10/04/one-dcs-busiest-streets-will-be-turned-into-car-free-experiment-saturday>.
- Yuni, M. (2019) *Street Vendor*, Anggadwita, G. (Interviewer), 15 January.